

MALAVIYA NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY JAIPUR

Minutes of the meetings of the Committee constituted to examine genuineness of the case, verification of facts and documents submitted by wards/dependents of deceased employees seeking appointments on compassionate grounds

The meeting of the Committee constituted under order No. F6(22) Misc/MNIT/04/Vol.IV/926 dated 28-10-2024 was held on 27-05-2025 in the Meeting Room adjacent to the Dean R&C Office, Prabha Bhawan, MNIT Jaipur, in continuation of earlier meetings held on 17.01.2025, 24.01.2025 and 04-03-2025.

The following members of the committee were present: -

S. No.	Name	Designation
1.	Prof. Jyotirmay Mathur	Member
2.	Prof. Rajeev Shringi	Member
3.	Prof. Kailash Singh	Member
4.	Shri Surya Prakash Sonwani	Member
5.	Prof. Rohit Bhakar	Registrar (I/c,) (Special Invitee)
6.	Shri R. K. Manjhiwal	Deputy Registrar (Estt.) (Special Invitee)
7.	Shri Ravi Radhakishan Lakhani	Asst. Registrar, (A/cs) (Special Invitee)

1. Committee considered the guidelines given in the scheme for Compassionate Appointment in MNIT Jaipur.
2. In continuation of the committee's previous recommendations, the institute communicated with the applicants. Subsequently, the institute received five representations. The committee reviewed each representation individually.
3. Based on the representation, the committee directed for compliance/action and requested the following documents as per the resolution made at the meeting held on March 4, 2025:
 - i) From Mr. Bhurendra Singh, Deputy Registrar (Hostel):
 - i. For Committee Resolution Point No. 2.4 (2 & 3) & 3
 - ii. For Committee Resolution Point No. 2.5 (2 & 3) & 3
 - ii) From Mr. Niranjana Pal Singh Rathore, AR (Outsourced Service Committee): to assist Mr. Bhurendra Singh, DR, on Committee Resolution Point No. 3.
 - iii) From Mr. Ravi Radhakishan Lakhani, Assistant Registrar (Accounts):
 - i. For Committee Resolution Point No. 2.4 (1) & 6
 - ii. For Committee Resolution Point No. 2.5 (1) & 6
 - iii. To assist Mr. Bhurendra Singh, DR, on Committee Resolution Point No. 3.

iv) For Legal Opinion:

i. For Committee Resolution Point No. 4.

In compliance with the above, the committee received all the desired documents as per the committee's resolution. The sealed envelope containing the legal opinion (attached as **Annexure A**) was opened with the consent of all members, including special invitees, at the meeting and was further deliberated upon.

4. The committee deliberated in detail and after examination of all received documents, observed as follows:

- i) The Accounts section has sent a letter to the nominee/dependent members of deceased employees to calculate their pension amount w.r.t. NPS.

Based on the committee's recommendation, the Accounts section again communicated with the applicants/nominees of deceased employees, requesting the submission of the duly filled NPS Exit Form within 10 days to the Accounts Section. This is to enable the institute to submit the same to PFRDA. With the condition that failing to submit the NPS Exit Form, the committee will assume that no further response will be forthcoming. Consequently, the committee will award zero marks in Column 7 (Family Pension column) and in response to that no reply received. The details of communication tabulated below:

Sl. No.	Name of Nominee /dependent of Deceased Employee	Issued letter (for reference)	Remarks/Status
1.	Smt. Archana Chopra w/o, Late Shri Rajendra Kumar Duchaniya	1) MNIT/Accounts/NPS/2020-21/1110 dated 03/08/2023 2) MNIT/Accounts/NPS/2020-21/1397 dated 22/01/2025 3) MNIT/Accounts/NPS/2020-21/1471 dated 15/04/2025	No Reply received till date
2.	Smt. Seema Udaiwal w/o Late Shri Rajesh Kumawat	1) MNIT/Accounts/NPS/2020-21/1109 dated 03/08/2023 2) MNIT/Accounts/NPS/2020-21/1396 dated 22/01/2025 3) MNIT/Accounts/NPS/2020-21/1470 dated 15/04/2025	No Reply received till date

(Kindly refer Annexure B)

- ii) Mr. Bhurendra Singh, Deputy Registrar, appointed for review and verification as per office order F6(22)/Misc/MNIT/04/Vol.V/1186 dated January 1, 2025, has submitted revised data concerning the annual income of earning members and income from property, as listed in Column 9. Necessary corrections to the relative merit have been made based on the information provided by the applicants in Column 10.

Additionally, Mr. Bhurendra Singh, Deputy Registrar, reviewed the movable/immovable assets and family property declared by the applicants under Column No. 10. He ensured the accuracy of this submitted information by verifying it with supporting documents, including undertakings provided by each applicant.

Based on these findings, the weightage points/relative merits have been updated/revised, and the signatures of each applicant were taken on the relative merit points sheet to ensure correctness and fairness. This revision reflects the data verified by Mr. Bhurendra Singh (the Verification Officer appointed as per the scheme), which was cross-referenced with information from the accounts department and the HR committee (specifically, the committee constituted for outsourced services) regarding annual income.

The committee also observed that even after awarding zero marks in Column 7 (Family Pension column) to Mr. Yaman Duchania and Ms. Bhavya Kumawat, in a comparative statement of all five applicants, they still ranked 4th and 5th, respectively, in the relative merit points after analysis. **(Kindly refer Annexure C)**

- iii) The Institute sought legal opinion for final review and recommendation regarding the two cases of NPS and on the relative merit calculation sheet for the approach of committee for award of marks under Column 7 (Family Pension column) and the committee received the legal opinion from Advocate Nathu Singh Chauhan, Advocate Rajasthan High Court Jaipur Bench.

In which he opined that “In view of the aforesaid facts and circumstances and provisions of law, I am of the considered opinion that Institute should not consider the applications of both the applicants Shri Yaman Duchaniya and Ms. Bhavya Kumawat in absence of the information relating to column no. 7 of family pension and they should be informed about the same that they can only be considered after providing the information relating to family pension.”

5. Based on the above observation and facts the committee submitted its recommendation as follows:

- i) The Relative Merit Points are submitted for consideration as **Annexure-D**.
- ii) As suggested in the legal opinion and based on three communications by the Account Section of the Institute for submission of the applicable NPS EXIT Form (in case of death) to Smt. Archana Chopra w/o Late Shri Rajendra Kumar Duchaniya and Smt. Seema Udaiwal w/o Late Shri Rajesh Kumawat, no reply has been received. Additionally, based on the report submitted by Mr. Bhurendra Singh, Deputy Registrar, with the consent of the applicants on the data, it is unanimously decided that without compliance, the cases of Mr. Yaman Duchania and Ms. Bhavya Kumawat cannot be taken into consideration, in the present recommendation/round of appointment on compassionate grounds.

Therefore, the remaining three cases of Shri Kailash s/o Late Shri Gulla Ram, Shri Dev Narayan s/o Late Shri Suwa Lal Bheel, and Shri Dinesh Kumar Mahawar s/o Late Shri Gopal Lal may be processed for consideration of appointment on compassionate grounds as per the availability of vacancy for a suitable position as per the scheme for compassionate appointment: Relative Merit Points Systems and Procedure for Selection.

- iii) The Committee recommends that if at any stage of verification or even after the appointment, the information submitted by the candidate (s) is found false, the candidature of candidate(s) should be rejected, and services be terminated forthwith without assigning any further reasons and further appropriate legal proceedings will be initiated against such candidate(s).

6. Meeting ended with vote of thanks.

-Sd-

Surya Prakash Sonwani
(Member)

-Sd-

Kailash Singh
(Member)

-Sd-

Rajeev Shringi
(Member)

-Sd-

Jyotirmay Mathur
(Member)

-Sd-

Ravi Radhakishan Lakhani
(Special Invitee)

-Sd-

R. K. Manjhiwal
(Special Invitee)

-Sd-

Rohit Bhakar,
(Special Invitee)

Annexure-D																		
COMPASSIONATE APPOINTMENT MNIT JAIPUR FOR THE YEAR-2025																		
Sl. No.	Name & Designation of the Institute employee (Deceased)	Date of Birth & Date of Death of the Institute employee (Deceased)	Name of the candidate for Compassionate Appointment	Relation & Details from Personal File (Dependent or not)	NOC from other dependents	PART-C : RELATIVE MERIT POINTS ASSESSMENT ON A 100 POINT-SCALE FOR COMPASSIONATE APPOINTMENT											Order of Merit	Remarks
						1. Income of the Family (Total : 40 points)			2.Movable/Immovable Assets/Property of the family (Latest Market Value) including fixed Deposit/Bank Balance, other investments, LIC claim etc. (excluding Service Benefits received as mentioned in point 1(iii) above)	3. Left over service of deceased/ Medically Invalidated Employee	4. Dependents i.e. Mother or Father, Spouse (House wife) only	5. Unmarried Daughters	6.Dependent Minor children	7. Unmarried Major Son (upto 25 years of age) and Dependent major son i.e. Physically and mentally challenged (without age limit)	Grand Total			
						i) Family Pension (Basic excluding DA & Allowances)	ii) Terminal benefits i.e. Lump sum amount received by the family on death of Government Servant (i.e DCR Gratuity, GPF/PPF A/C balance, CGEGIS, Leave encashment)	iii) Annual Income of earning member & Income from property : Income Apart from Service Benefits - Annual income from Movable/Immovable property as well as annual income earned by the other member(s) of the family										
																20 Points		
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	
1	Late Shri Gulla Ram	09.10.1962 & 13.08.2020	Shri Kailash	Son/ Dependent	Received	12	4	2	0	2	5	5	0	0	30	3	B.A. & M.A.	
						Rs. 19900	Rs. 20,69,122/- (Gratuity + GPF + Leave Encashment)	Rs. 1,71,156/-	Rs. 61,51,964/- (LIC+GSLI+Land)	2 Y 2 M 18 D	Wife	1	0	0				
2	Late Shri Suwa Lal Bheel	13.09.1960 & 05.10.2015	Shri Dev Narayan	Son/ Dependent	Received	14	2	0	10	3	5	5	0	3	42	1	12th	
						Rs. 17,150/-	Rs. 10,09,249/- (Gratuity + GPF + Leave Encashment)	Rs. 3,23,386/-	NIL	4 Y 11 M 25 D	Wife	1	0	1				
3	Late Shri Gopal Lal	13.03.1965 & 13.06.2023	Shri Dinesh Kumar Mahawar	Son/ Dependent	Received	14	0	0	4	1	5	10	0	0	34	2	12th	
						Rs. 18750	Rs. 34,12,992/- (GPF + Gratuity + Leave Encashment)	Rs. 2,86,863/-	Rs. 12,00,000/-	1 Y 9 M 18 D	Wife	2	0	0				
4	Late Shri Rajendra Kumar Duchaniya	15.05.1975 & 27.04.2021	Shri Yaman Duchaniya	Son/ Dependent	Received	*	0	0	4	10	5	0	5	3	*	*	12th	
						*	Rs. 32,48,250/- (Gratuity + Leave Encashment)	Rs. 3,00,000/-	Rs. 11,00,000/-	19 Y 1 M 4 D	Wife	0	1	1				
5	Late Dr. Rajesh Kumawat	10.07.1975 & 09.05.2023	Ms. Bhavya Kumawat	Daughter/ Dependent	Received	*	9	0	0	7	5	5	0	0	*	*	12th	
						*	Rs. 11,20,288/- (Gratuity + Leave Encashment)	Rs. 2,65,150/-	Rs. 33,83,216/-	12 Y 2 M 22 D	Wife	1	0	0				
6	Late Shri Prakash	07.10.1962 & 12.01.2016	Shri Vijay Umarwal	Son/ Dependent	Application Form not received.													
7	Late Shri Ashok	18.01.1983 & 15.10.2024	Mrs. Godi Devi	Mother/ Dependent	Application Form not received.													
8	Late Shri Tikam Chand	10.07.1976 & 25.03.2024	Mrs. Sheetal	Wife/ Dependent	Application Form not received. However, Mrs. Sheetal has requested to consider his elder son Sh. Raj Singh Gurjar (Presently-14 years) as and when he become eligible.													
9	Late Dr. Awadhesh Kumar	21.10.1962 & 13.09.2018	Ms. Anita Bhardwaj	Wife/ Dependent	Application Form not received.													

NOTE: If at any stage of verification or even after the appointment, the information submitted by the candidate (s) is found false, the candidature of candidate(s) should be rejected, and services be terminated forthwith without assigning any further reasons and further appropriate legal proceedings will be initiated against such candidate(s).

*****As suggested in the legal opinion and based on three communications by the Account Section of the Institute for submission of the applicable NPS EXIT Form (in case of death) to Smt. Archana Chopra w/o Late Shri Rajendra Kumar Duchaniya and Smt. Seema Udaiwal w/o Late Shri Rajesh Kumawat, no reply has been received. Additionally, based on the report submitted by Mr. Bhurendra Singh, Deputy Registrar, with the consent of the applicants on the data, it is unanimously decided that without compliance, the cases of Mr. Yaman Duchania and Ms. Bhavya Kumawat cannot be taken into consideration, in the present recommendation/round of appointment on compassionate grounds. Therefore, the remaining three cases of Shri Kailash s/o Late Shri Gulla Ram, Shri Dev Narayan s/o Late Shri Suwa Lal Bheel, and Shri Dinesh Kumar Mahawar s/o Late Shri Gopal Lal may be processed for consideration of appointment on compassionate grounds as per the availability of vacancy for a suitable position as per the scheme for compassionate appointment: Relative Merit Points Systems and Procedure for Selection.

Sd Shri Surya Prakash Sonwani (Member)	Sd Prof. Kailash Singh (Member)	Sd Prof. Rajeev Shringi (Member)	Sd Prof. Jyotirmay Mathur (Member)	Sd Shri Ravi Radhakishan Lakhani (Special Invitee)	Sd Shri R. K. Manjhiwal (Special Invitee)	Sd Prof. Rohit Bhakar (Special Invitee)
----------------------------------------------	---------------------------------------	----------------------------------------	------------------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------